

PROBABILITIES, HYPOTHETICALS, AND COUNTERFACTUALS IN ANCIENT GREEK THOUGHT

This volume explores the conceptual terrain defined by the Greek word *eikos*: the probable, likely, or reasonable. A term of art in Greek rhetoric, a defining feature of literary fiction, a seminal mode of historical, scientific, and philosophical inquiry, *eikos* was a way of thinking about the probable and improbable, the factual and counterfactual, the hypothetical and the real. These thirteen original and provocative studies examine the plausible arguments of courtroom speakers and the "likely stories" of philosophers, verisimilitude in art and literature, the likelihood of resemblance in human reproduction, the limits of human knowledge, and the possibilities of ethical and political agency. The first synthetic study of probabilistic thinking in ancient Greece, the volume illuminates a fascinating chapter in the history of Western thought.

VICTORIA WOHL is Professor of Classics at the University of Toronto. She works on the literature and culture of classical Athens. Her previously published work includes *Law's Cosmos: Juridical Discourse in Athenian Forensic Oratory* (2010), *Love among the Ruins: The Erotics of Democracy in Classical Athens* (2002), and *Intimate Commerce: Exchange, Gender, and Subjectivity in Greek Tragedy* (1998).



PROBABILITIES, HYPOTHETICALS, AND COUNTERFACTUALS IN ANCIENT GREEK THOUGHT

EDITED BY
VICTORIA WOHL







One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India
103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107050495

© Cambridge University Press & Assessment 2014

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2014

 $A\ catalogue\ record\ for\ this\ publication\ is\ available\ from\ the\ British\ Library$

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication data

Probabilities, hypotheticals, and counterfactuals in ancient Greek thought / edited by Victoria Wohl.

pages cm

Includes bibliographical references and index. ISBN 978-1-107-05049-5 (hardback)

1. Philosophy, Ancient. 2. Reasoning. 3. Probabilities. 4. Logic, Ancient. 5. Greece – Civilization – To 146 B.C. 1. Wohl, Victoria, 1966– editor of compilation.

B187.R35P76 2014

180 – dc23 2014002500

ISBN 978-1-107-05049-5 Hardback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



Contents

List of illustrations Notes on contributors Preface		<i>page</i> vii viii xi
	Introduction: eikos in ancient Greek thought Victoria Wohl	I
Ι	Eikos arguments in Athenian forensic oratory Michael Gagarin	15
2	Eikos in Plato's Phaedrus Jenny Bryan	30
3	Aristotle on the value of "probability," persuasiveness, and verisimilitude in rhetorical argument <i>James Allen</i>	47
4	"Likely stories" and the political art in Plato's <i>Laws</i> Ryan K. Balot	65
5	Open and speak your mind: citizen agency, the likelihood of truth, and democratic knowledge in archaic and classical Greece Vincent Farenga	84
6	Counterfactual history and Thucydides *Robert Tordoff*	101
7	Homer's Achaean wall and the hypothetical past Karen Bassi	122
8	Play of the improbable: Euripides' unlikely <i>Helen Victoria Wohl</i>	142

V



vi	Contents	
9	Revision in Greek literary papyri Sean Gurd	160
IO	Likeness and likelihood in classical Greek art Verity Platt	185
II	"Why doesn't my baby look like me?" Likeness and likelihood in ancient theories of reproduction Daryn Lehoux	208
12	Galen on the chances of life Brooke Holmes	230
13	Afterword Catherine Gallagher	251
Ref	References	
Ind	Index locorum	
Ger	General index	



Illustrations

Ι	Riace Warrior A, Museo Archeologico Nazionale, Reggio	
	Calabria. Photo Credit: Erich Lessing / Art Resource NY	<i>page</i> 191
2	Riace Warrior B, Museo Archeologico Nazionale, Reggio	
	Calabria. Photo Credit: Erich Lessing / Art Resource NY	192
3	Aphrodite of the Agora, Agora Museum, Athens (Agora S 1882)	
	Photo: Richard Neer	194
4	Grave stele of Pausimache, National Museum, Athens (3964).	
	Image source: Art Resource NY	196
5	Attic red-figure calyx krater attributed to the Altamura Painter,	
	Museum of Fine Arts, Boston (59.176)	202
6	Fragment of an Apulian red-figure calyx krater attributed to the	:
	Painter of the Birth of Dionysus, Allard Pierson Museum,	
	Amsterdam (2579). Photo courtesy of the Allard Pierson	
	Museum, Amsterdam	204
7	Apulian red-figure column-krater attributed to the Group of	
	Boston, Metropolitan Museum of Art, Rogers Fund (50.11.4).	
	Image copyright, the Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York.	
	Image source: Art Resource NY	205
8	Reverse side of Figure 7. Image copyright, the Metropolitan	
	Museum of Art New York Image source: Art Resource NV	206



Notes on contributors

- JAMES ALLEN is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Pittsburgh. He is the author of *Inference from Signs: Ancient Debates about the Nature of Evidence* (2001) and articles about aspects of Stoicism, Epicureanism, ancient scepticism, ancient medicine, and Aristotelian logic and dialectic, among other things. He is currently working on a book about the Aristotelian disciplines of argument (logic, rhetoric, and dialectic).
- RYAN K. BALOT is Professor of Political Science and Classics at the University of Toronto. The author of *Greed and Injustice in Classical Athens* (2001), *Greek Political Thought* (2006), and *Courage and Its Critics in Democratic Athens* (2014), and editor of *A Companion to Greek and Roman Political Thought* (2009), Balot specializes in American, early modern, and classical political thought. His essays and reviews have appeared in *Political Theory, Ancient Philosophy, Social Research, Review of Politics, Arion, American Journal of Philology, Classical Quarterly, The Journal of Hellenic Studies*, and Rhetorica. His current projects include work on Machiavelli's republicanism.
- KAREN BASSI is Professor of Classics and Literature at the University of California at Santa Cruz. In addition to articles on Greek literature and historiography, she is the author of *Acting Like Men. Gender, Drama and Nostalgia in Ancient Greece* (1998) and co-editor, with Peter Euben, of *When Worlds Elide: Classics, Politics, Culture* (2010). She is currently working on a book on the relationship between visual perception and the passing of time in ancient Greek narrative.
- JENNY BRYAN is Lecturer in Classical Philosophy at University College London. She is the author of *Likeness and Likelihood in the Presocratics and Plato* (Cambridge, 2012).
- VINCENT FARENGA is Professor of Classics and Comparative Literature at the University of Southern California. In addition to articles exploring

viii



Notes on contributors

ix

poststructural theory and contemporary reinterpretations of archaic and classical Greek poetry, rhetoric, and politics (tyranny), he is the author of *Citizen and Self in Ancient Greece*: *Individuals Performing Justice and the Law* (Cambridge, 2006), an investigation into the productive tension between citizen identity and individualism in Greek culture from Homer to the end of the Athenian democracy. His current research project, *Authoring Justice*, contrasts contemporary narratives about the experience of injustice in multiple cultures to the efforts of political philosophers to elaborate a universal theory of justice.

MICHAEL GAGARIN is James R. Dougherty, Jr. Centennial Professor of Classics Emeritus at the University of Texas at Austin. He has published widely, primarily on ancient Greek law and rhetoric, most recently Writing Greek Law (Cambridge, 2008) and Speeches from Athenian Law (2011). He was Editor-in-Chief of the Oxford Encyclopedia of Ancient Greece and Rome (2010) in seven volumes. He is currently preparing, with a colleague, an edition of The Laws of Ancient Crete.

CATHERINE GALLAGHER is the emeritus Eggers Professor of English Literature at the University of California at Berkeley. Her books include The Industrial Reformation of English Fiction: Social Discourse and Narrative Form, 1832–67 (1985), Nobody's Story: The Vanishing Acts of Women Writers in the Literary Marketplace (1994), Practicing New Historicism (2000, with Stephen Greenblatt), and The Body Economic: Life, Death, and Sensation in Political Economy and the Victorian Novel (2006). She is currently writing a history of modern counterfactual historical narratives.

SEAN GURD teaches at the University of Missouri-Columbia. He has written two books, *Iphigenias at Aulis* (2005) and *Work in Progress* (2012), edited one volume of essays, *Philology and its Histories* (2010), and translated one Greek tragedy, Euripides' *Hippolytus* (2012).

BROOKE HOLMES is an Associate Professor and the Elias Boudinot Bicentennial Preceptor in the Department of Classics at Princeton University. She is the author of *The Symptom and the Subject: The Emergence of the Physical Body in Ancient Greece* (2010) and *Gender: Antiquity and Its Legacy* (2012), and two co-edited volumes, *Aelius Aristides between Greece, Rome, and the Gods* (2008) and *Dynamic Reading: Studies in the Reception of Epicureanism* (2012), as well as numerous articles on Greek literature, the history of medicine and the body, and ancient philosophy.



x

Cambridge University Press & Assessment 978-1-107-05049-5 — Probabilities, Hypotheticals, and Counterfactuals in Ancient Greek Thought Victoria Wohl Frontmatter More Information

Notes on contributors

DARYN LEHOUX is Professor of Classics at Queen's University. He is the author of What Did the Romans Know? An Inquiry into Science and Worldmaking (2012) and Astronomy, Weather, and Calendars in the Ancient World (Cambridge, 2007), as well as the co-editor (with A. D. Morrison and A. Sharrock) of Lucretius: Poetry, Philosophy, Science (2013).

VERITY PLATT is Associate Professor of Classics and the History of Art at Cornell University. She is the author of *Facing the Gods: Epiphany and Representation in Graeco-Roman Art, Literature and Religion* (Cambridge, 2011) and co-editor, with M. Squire, of *The Art of Art History in Graeco-Roman Antiquity* (2010). In particular, she focuses on the relationship between image and text in antiquity, and is currently working on the lives of ancient Greek artists.

ROBERT TORDOFF teaches Greek and Roman Literature in the Department of Humanities at York University in Toronto. His research and publications focus on Greek literature, Greek social history, and the reception of classical literature in the long eighteenth century. He has co-edited, with Ben Akrigg, *Slaves and Slavery in Ancient Greek Comic Drama* (Cambridge, 2013) and is finishing a book on Aristophanes' late plays, *Assembly Women* and *Wealth*.

VICTORIA WOHL is Professor of Classics at the University of Toronto. Her research focuses on the literature and culture of classical Athens, spanning a variety of genres, poetic and prosaic. She is the author of Intimate Commerce: Exchange, Gender, and Subjectivity in Greek Tragedy (1998), Love among the Ruins: The Erotics of Democracy in Classical Athens (2002), and Law's Cosmos: Juridical Discourse in Athenian Forensic Oratory (Cambridge, 2010). She is currently working on the politics of form in Euripides.



Preface

This volume began its rather unlikely existence as a workshop entitled "Eikos: Probabilities, Hypotheticals, and Counterfactuals in Ancient Greek Thought," held at the University of Toronto in May 2010. The purpose of the workshop was twofold. The first aim was to use the notion of eikos – the probable or likely – as a means of traversing the sub-disciplines of Classics; interdisciplinarity was not just a methodological principle of the workshop but also an object of study, as we explicitly examined the way in which the concept mutated from one discourse to another. Second, we explored whether, given these discursive variations, eikos in fact denoted a coherent set of issues for the Greeks and whether it thus constitutes a coherent object of scholarly analysis. We determined that it did and it does. As our discussions revealed the fruitful intersections and (sometimes surprising) connections between our different sub-areas, we concluded that eikos was valuable both as a vehicle for analyzing our field's interdisciplinarity and as a central category of ancient Greek thought. Hence this volume.

The workshop was sponsored by the Department of Classics at the University of Toronto and a workshop grant from the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada. I would like to thank my thenchair, Alison Keith, for her support, and the graduate students, Adriana Brook Carter, Marie-Pierre Krück, Miranda Robinson, and Lee Sawchuk, who participated in the workshop as moderators. I am particularly grateful to Marie-Pierre Krück for her invaluable aid in organizing the event, as well as for her eagle-eyed assistance in copy-editing the volume. She was also responsible for finding the cover image, Marcel Duchamp's *Network of Stoppages*. Vincent Farenga deserves the credit (or blame) for encouraging me to publish the results of our workshop. The process has been full of contingencies, and at various points it looked as if this volume would itself remain purely hypothetical, if not counterfactual. My thanks to Michael Sharp for his help in making it actual, as well as to all the contributors for their patience and their superb contributions. Finally, I am grateful to Erik



xii Preface

Gunderson for sharing with me the fruits of his own editorial experience, for his advice and good judgment throughout the process, and for his unflagging support, both technical and moral.

Abbreviations of ancient authors and titles can be found in *The Oxford Classical Dictionary*, ed. S. Hornblower and A. Spawforth, 3rd edn., 1996.